**Interactive comment on “Scale effect on runoff and soil loss control using rice straw mulch under laboratory conditions” by S. H. R. Sadeghi et al.**

**Anonymous Referee #1**

Received and published: 22 October 2014

Introduction

The authors give a moderate vision of the state of the art, there are many studies about this topic that are not reflected in this apart, in fact there are many references about it in the bibliography, that are not cited in text. Material and Methods Please explain better this apart, some questions are not very clear. How many plots do you have per treatment? Do you use the same plots for control and after the first rains, replace with new soil and put the treatment? Please explain the reason to choose the size of plots. Are these sizes representatives of a model? Field conditions? Why do you chose 0.25 m² it is really small? Could you provide the kinetic energy of rain? 90 mm h⁻¹ is really strong rain. Could you give some climatic characteristics of the area of soil study? Could you provide some characteristic of the soil: complete texture, OM, EC, pH, Aggregate Stability? The statistics are not enough, in my opinion other test as Tukey or ANOVA should be done to compare the differences between treatments, also SD must be given with the data.

Results